

---

The final chapter is organized in five sections. Section 6.1 summarises the main findings from the studies. The conclusions that can be drawn in answer to the questions addressed and in the study are formulated in section 6.2. Some policy implications which emerge from our analysis are discussed in section 6.3. Section 6.4 entails certain limitations of the present study and in the last section 6.5 highlight the future scope of the research studies.

### **6.1 Summary**

#### *Volume, Trend and Pattern of Migration*

Among the four patterns of migration in West Bengal rural to rural in-migration was substantially high compare to others and it was 68.35 per cent in 1991. There was a sharp increase in annual growth rate of rural to urban in-migration during 1991 to 2011. That is, during the last two decades the urban area of West Bengal could attract more in-migrants compare to the rural area. Like other states such as Delhi, Maharashtra, Karnataka, Punjab, Haryana, and Gujarat, the state of West Bengal has also been one of the main migration-destination states for both male and female migrants. These are supposed to be economically more developed states towards which they move for job search, subsistence living or for shelter.

The growth rate of urban to rural out-migration form the relatively backward districts has been higher compared to that for the relatively developed districts during 1991 to 2001. This is obvious since, the migrant workers of relatively backward districts feel higher urge towards out-migration from urban centers of the relatively backward districts to

even rural area in search of livelihood. The growth rates of the relatively backward districts like Koach Bihar, Dinajpur, Puruliya and Maldah also reveal the fact. The average annual growth rate of urban to urban migration from the relatively developed districts of West Bengal has been much higher compare to the relatively backward districts of West Bengal. The workers have migrated from the urban area of the districts having low degree urbanization to the urban area of the districts having high degree urbanization particularly in districts like Kolkata for doing non-agricultural works. The higher expected urban wage of the destination district has always been a significant pull factor for the inter-district urban to urban migration in post-economic reform period.

Within the relatively backward districts of West Bengal the male in-migration was significantly higher than male out-migration in 1991. But in 2001 the male out-migration was significantly higher than male in-migration. As we compare the relatively developed districts with relatively backward districts the volume of out-migration was significantly higher in the former than that of the latter in 1991 as well as 2001. In case of in-migration the volume was also significantly higher in the relatively developed districts than that of the relatively less developed districts in 2001.

### ***Determinants of Migration***

Both push and pull factors affect the inter-districts male in-migration. Pull factors like population density, urbanisation, literacy rate, relative shares of service and construction sectors are positively related with the male in-migration and their relationships are statistically significant. But the push factors like unemployment rate and low agricultural productivity are inversely related with the male in-migration.

The probit estimate of the determinants of migration at the household level in West Bengal is analysed using NSSO Unit Level data (2007-08). The member (s) of households belonging to rural region is found to be more likely to migrate than those in urban region. The probability of migration also increases with the increase age of the head of the

household but at a decreasing rate. Again the households whose families comprise a female head are more likely to migrate compared to that in case of male headed households. The households having members with lower level of education show greater possibility of migration and the push factor becomes main driving force of migration. The marginal landholding households are more likely to migrate because they have the extreme need for additional income. It is seen that members of the Scheduled Tribes (ST), Scheduled Castes (SC) and Other Backward Castes (OBC) are less likely to migrate as compared to the members of the General castes (GEN).

### ***Determinants and Impact of Remittances***

Out of total remittance of West Bengal the share of remittance received by the rural area was higher than that of the urban area in 2007-08. This is due to the fact that relatively larger number of households of rural area received remittance compared to the urban area. At the district level, households of the backward districts in West Bengal received a higher proportion of remittances than the developed districts.

The probit estimate of the determinants of remittances received at the household level in West Bengal is also analysed using NSSO Unit Level data (2007-08). The household heads that are more aged or elderly are more likely to receive remittances. The households whose families comprise a female head are more likely to receive remittances compared to that in case of male headed households. The results signify that female headed households mainly depend on remittance income. An increase in the number of children less than six years and number of adult members above sixty years in a household have a greater probability of receiving remittances. This result supports the purely altruistic motive of the migrants sending remittances towards households and shows that they indeed care about their family. Again, the households belonging to rural region is found to be more likely to receive remittances than those in urban region. Educational attainments determine the earning capacity or potential of the migrant. The households whose members are having

secondary and higher secondary educations are found to be more likely to receive remittances. This apart, it is found that the probability of receiving remittances is higher among the households with large and medium sized landholdings as compared to households owning marginal, small and very small landholdings. Smaller the size of the households higher is the scope of remittance received i.e., the probability of remittance received decreases as the average size of the households increases. Among the social groups, the families belonging to ST and SC households are less likely to receive remittances than OBC and GEN households. The households residing in relatively backward districts are found to be less likely to receive remittance than those residing in relatively developed districts but this difference is not statistically significant.

In case of poorer households, after meeting the basic needs from remittance income they have nothing to use for other purposes. Only small numbers of households spend on healthcare and other household consumption expenditure. Middle income households also used remittance income for purchasing food items. Remittance can help finance the healthcare and other household expenditure of high income households to a larger extent than their low income counterparts.

Remittance utilization pattern across social groups indicate a higher reported use of remittances towards basic consumption needs by the ST and SC group, whereas OBC and GEN group had a diversified spending pattern of their remittances on healthcare, durable household goods and education along with food consumption expenditure. Remittances have contributed to fulfill the income gap of the remittance receiving households and can remove poverty to a certain extent. In absolute term, it is observed that remittance receiving households spends more on food items and consumption goods compared to that of non-remittance receiving households and the difference is positive and statistically significant. Investment expenditure is also very much limited and primarily

devoted to expenditure on healthcare. This result may also suggest that migration and remittances act as coping strategies to mitigate health risks.

Remittance has played a significant impact on the reduction of poverty in both rural and urban regions. In the rural region remittances have reduced head count ratio (HCR) to the extent of 4 percentage points. In case of urban region it is about 1.7 percentage points. It is observed that though in the relatively backward districts HCR and poverty-gap are much higher than those for the developed districts but remittance played a significant role in the reduction of HCR as well as poverty-gap in both backward and developed districts. But the reduction of HCR and poverty gap are relatively higher in the developed districts than that of the less developed districts.

The Heckman two-step is used to determine the incidence of poverty and the depth of poverty simultaneously. The result suggests that the incidence of poverty (POVT) as well as depth of poverty (POVTG) significantly decreases by the increase of monthly per capita remittance received. Again if the size of land holding among the households increases there have been more likely to decrease the incidence of poverty as well as depth of poverty. This means income from agriculture and with additional income from remittances have played a significant role for betterment of standard of living and the reduction of the incidence of poverty. The earning potential of the migrant can be determine by education. So, as the higher educated migrants (graduation and above or technical degree or diploma holders) are capable to send larger amount of remittance towards the households and thus the incidence of poverty and depth of poverty decrease among these households. The probability of incidence of poverty is high for those households who are belonging to SC and ST communities and the households who are located in relatively less developed districts. The households located in rural area are more likely to be poor. The size of households is positively related with the incidence as well as depth of poverty, i.e., the households with larger members are more likely to be poor. The

incidence as well as the depth of poverty decrease with the increase of the age of the head of the household. Lastly, it is evident that the households whose head of the family is female she is more likely to be poor and poverty gap is also high.

The separate empirical estimation of Heckman selection model – two-step in case of the relatively backward districts indicates that remittances with other factors have played a significant role in reducing poverty across households and the nature of relationships are quite same as in the whole of the West Bengal.

### **Livelihood Pattern of Sample Migrant Households**

The livelihood pattern of the sample households is analysed on the basis of field survey data of 480 sample migrant households of four backward districts in West Bengal. Most of the sample migrant households fall in the category of small and marginal landholdings. So, most of them have uneconomic size of land holdings which are insufficient to ensure subsistence level of living as well as generating some marketable surplus. The earnings from remittances constitute about 57 per cent of the gross annual income of the migrant households. That is the earnings from remittances play a crucial role in determining the livelihood pattern of the households. Out of 597 out-migrants 76 per cent were within the age group of 18-35 years and 59 per cent had an educational qualification up to secondary level and the share of migrants belonging to graduate and above level has been found to be low, only 8 per cent. The inter-state migration remained most prominent in this case and it has been followed by inter-district migration within West Bengal. Only about 5 per cent of the sample out-migrants moved out-side India in countries like Middle East. Among the sample migrants 69 per cent have migrated to search for employment, the primary factor behind out-migration. This is followed by about 15 per cent cases where migration decision has been taken to search out better employment opportunities.

Out of total sample out-migrants about 91 per cent remain engaged in the informal sector and among them 93 per cent express their dissatisfaction regarding the physical

condition of work. As the income is concerned 59 per cent of sample migrant workers earned an average monthly income of ₹ 5000 to ₹ 10000. This is obvious because of their attachment to informal sector with poor wages and salaries. Only 12 per cent of the migrant workers received medical facilities in their work place, only 24 per cent of them received insurance benefit and only 17 per cent of them received the benefits of residential accommodation in their work places. Thus, most of the migrant workers were deprived in respect of the social protection benefits. Out of total migrants 73 per cent sent the remittance up to the amount ₹ 5000 per month and the remittance ranged from ₹ 5000 to ₹ 10000 per month only for 15 per cent.

The average years of education of household members, per capita operational land holding, share of remittances received to total family income and service income are directly affect the monthly per capita income across households and their relationships is found to be statistically significant. The monthly per capita income is relatively low for the households with higher dependency ratio and the households who depend on wage labour and livestock rearing. The regression analysis of the determinants of monthly per capita remittances (MPCRR) shows that caste affiliation, dependency ratio, number of migrants, duration of migration and earnings per month of the migrant have statistically significant positive influenced upon MPCRR.

The result of the Probit estimation indicates that the possibility of the incidence of poverty of migrant household becomes lower for the upper caste households and the households with higher average years of education of the, larger size of per capita operating land holding and higher share of remittance received to the total income . However, for a migrant household the flow of remittances received from migrant members and its share in total income of the household seems to be the sine qua non for diminution of the intensity of poverty. Our result also indicates that higher is the share of remittances in total household income, lower is the incidence of poverty for migrant family.

## 6.2 Conclusions

Among the four patterns of migration (such as rural-urban, rural-rural, urban-rural and urban-urban) in West Bengal the growth, both in absolute and relative terms, of rural to urban and urban to urban in-migration was higher than the others. However, so far as the percentage share of the patterns of migration in the total migration is concerned, the most prominent share is attributed to the pattern of rural to rural and urban to urban migration where the former reveals a decreasing share while the latter indicates an increasing share. The urban center of relatively developed districts of West Bengal could generate higher pull factors to attract the in-migrants. The higher expected urban wage of the destination district has always been a highly significant pull factor for the inter-district urban to urban and rural to urban migration in post-economic reform period. The average out-migration of male migrants remained higher compared to their in-migration for relatively developed districts of West Bengal. This may signify that the migrants of relatively developed districts remained better informed regarding the job opportunities. However, for relatively less developed districts of West Bengal the average out-migration was found to be lower than that of in-migration of male workers.

Inter-district migration in West Bengal, especially male in-migration, is caused due to economic development of a district and induced the workers to migrate from backward to developed districts. The districts with high rate of unemployment and low agricultural productivity have witnessed low in-migration. So, economic development is the key to the solution of migration problems. At the household level the age and sex of the household head, educational attainments of the migrant, the average size of landholding etc. have significantly explained the migration decision. The member(s) of female-headed households, marginal landholding class in rural region, educational attainments below primary level and scheduled castes and scheduled tribe households revealed greater possibility of migration. That is, both push and pull factors affect the migration.



As remittance is concerned it is found that the large and medium sized landholdings households received more remittances compared to the households owning marginal, small and very small landholdings. Among the social groups, the families belonging to ST and SC communities are less likely to receive remittances than non-SC and non-ST households. Not only that the households whose members are having secondary and higher secondary educations are found to be more likely to receive remittances. This apart, the rural area of relatively less developed districts of West Bengal received more remittance compared to the developed districts. At the district level, households of the backward districts in West Bengal receive a higher proportion of remittances than the developed districts. The remittance has played a significant role in the reduction of incidence as well as depth of poverty in backward vis-à-vis developed districts. But the reduction of is relatively higher in the developed districts than that of the less developed districts. Remittances have filled in the income gap of the remittance receiving households and helped in alleviating poverty to a certain extent. This has also led to investment in human and physical capital at the household level.

This study shows that with an increase in the receipt of monthly per capita remittance the probability of poverty as well as depth of poverty of the household decreases. However, other general factors such as the dependency ratio, average years of education of the members of the households, size of land holding and supplementary income sources also play an important role in determining the monthly per capita income of the migrant households.

### **6.3 Policy Implications**

From the above discussion the following policy recommendation may be made:

I. The districts with high unemployment rate and low agricultural productivity induced distress migration of the workers. To stop the distress migration the pro-backward region development policy and their effective execution would be inevitable. The development strategy favouring rural development, especially, the development of various agro-based small and cottage industries in particular and expansion of rural non-farm activities in general seems to be much more appropriate towards the reduction of the tendency of migration to urban area.

II. The process of urbanization in West Bengal has been lopsided and top-heavy, which has concentrated mainly in the areas around Kolkata only. Small cities/towns, on the other hand, have experienced low demographic and economic growth. Therefore, people from the rural area as well as the small towns of the districts with lower urbanization indices have no other option than to migrate to the already over-crowded and degenerated peripheries of Kolkata in search of better-paid urban jobs. To prevent these people from migrating to these districts, Government should take necessary steps to develop small town/cities by setting up industries, infrastructure, and institutions.

III. Majority of the migrants from the backward districts were worked at low paid and low remunerative works because of their education and skill deficiencies. Besides basic education, vocational training and technical skill are useful in gaining access of better paid job. In recognition of this need, a large number of technical training institutes and polytechnic colleges have been established by the government.

IV. Most of the out-migrants from the backward districts remain engaged in the informal sector and their physical condition of work is not satisfactory. They have neglected from medical, insurance and other facilities at work place. The effective implementation of the

social protection policy could protect from the exploitation of the workers engaged in informal sector.

V. There is a need to develop the quality of local entrepreneurship in the rural and semi urban area. Rural entrepreneurship may nurture, supported and encouraged through the systematic programme of training local entrepreneurs.

VI. The extensive information of migration and remittances are limited in our country. Comprehensive system of data collection on Migration is inevitable to understand the dynamics and the problems of in-migration and out-migration.

#### **6.4 Limitations of the Study**

The present study suffers from the limitations that are mentioned as follows:

- I. The present study could not be analysed the recent trend and pattern of inter-districts migration because of the unavailability of the information of migration in Census 2011.
- II. The present study could not evaluate Impact of MGNREGA and other social protection programmes to stop distress migration from the backward districts.
- III. Present study analyses the remittances of the migrants across the households in a specific time point. It could not be analysed the dynamics of migration and flow of remittance over time.
- IV. The present study explores the trend, pattern and determinants of migration. While the Seasonal migration and circular migration could not be studied.
- V. Present study analyses the determinants and impact of remittances in West Bengal. While it could not be analysed by segregating the internal and international remittances.

## **6.5 Scope of Further Research**

- I. The trend, pattern and the determinants of seasonal and circular migration may be studied in details and depth.
- II. The inflow of international remittances and their impact in the state economy of West Bengal may be analysed in details and depth.
- III. The impact of MGNREGA and other social protection programmes to stop distress migration from the backward districts may be analysed in depth on the basis of detailed field survey data.
- IV. The recent trend and pattern of inter-districts migration may be analysed in depth incorporating the information of migration in Census 2011 when it will be available.
- V. The dynamics of the migration and the flow of remittances may be analysed on the basis of time series data at the aggregate level and micro-panel data at the household level.